

# United States Patent and Trademark Office

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	F	ILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.	
10/811,891		03/30/2004	Werner Stamm	1454.1009-CIP	1454.1009-CIP 1323	
21171	7590	12/19/2005		EXAM	EXAMINER	
STAAS & HALSEY LLP			KOEHLER,	KOEHLER, ROBERT R		
SUITE 700 1201 NEW YORK AVENUE, N.W.				ART UNIT	ART UNIT PAPER NUMBER	
WASHINGTON, DC 20005				1775	1775	

DATE MAILED: 12/19/2005

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

	Application No.	Applicant(s)					
	10/811,891	STAMM, WERNER					
Office Action Summary	Examiner	Art Unit					
	Robert R. Koehler	1775					
The MAILING DATE of this communication app Period for Reply	ears on the cover sheet with the c	orrespondence address					
A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DA  - Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.13 after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.  - If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period w  - Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).	ATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION 36(a). In no event, however, may a reply be tin fill apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from cause the application to become ABANDONE	N. nely filed the mailing date of this communication. D (35 U.S.C. § 133).					
Status							
1) Responsive to communication(s) filed on Septe	ember 30, 2005 (Amdt., Rem., T.	<u>D.)</u> .					
, <u></u>	action is non-final.						
·—	Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is						
closed in accordance with the practice under E							
Disposition of Claims							
4)⊠ Claim(s) <u>6-19</u> is/are pending in the application.							
4a) Of the above claim(s) is/are withdrawn from consideration.							
5)⊠ Claim(s) <u>16-19</u> is/are allowed.							
6)⊠ Claim(s) <u>6-15</u> is/are rejected.							
7) Claim(s) is/are objected to.							
8) Claim(s) are subject to restriction and/or	election requirement.						
Application Papers							
9) The specification is objected to by the Examine		I the Eventure					
10)⊠ The drawing(s) filed on 30 March 2004 is/are: a							
Applicant may not request that any objection to the							
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correct 11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Ex							
Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119							
12)⊠ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign	priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)	)-(d) or (f).					
a)⊠ All b)□ Some * c)□ None of:							
1. Certified copies of the priority documents	1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.						
2. Certified copies of the priority documents	2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. 09/674,328 and						
<u>10/279,580</u> .							
3. Copies of the certified copies of the prior	ity documents have been receive	ed in this National Stage					
application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).							
* See the attached detailed Office action for a list	of the certified copies not receive	ed.					
RRX.							
12-12-05							
Attachment(s)							
Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)     Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)	Paper No(s)/Mail D	ate					
3) Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08)	· <u>—</u>	Patent Application (PTO-152)					
Paper No(s)/Mail Date	6)  Other:						

Art Unit: 1775

#### **DETAILED ACTION**

#### Terminal Disclaimer

The terminal disclaimer filed on September 30, 2005 disclaiming the terminal portion of any patent granted on this application which would extend beyond the expiration date of any patent granted on Application Number 10/701,837 (Stamm) has been reviewed and is accepted. The terminal disclaimer has been recorded.

## Response to Arguments

The indicated allowability of claims 6 to 15 is withdrawn in view of the newly discovered reference(s) to U.S. Patent No. 6,610,419 B1 (Stamm). Rejections based on the newly cited reference(s) follow.

### **Double Patenting**

The nonstatutory double patenting rejection is based on a judicially created doctrine grounded in public policy (a policy reflected in the statute) so as to prevent the unjustified or improper timewise extension of the "right to exclude" granted by a patent and to prevent possible harassment by multiple assignees. A nonstatutory obviousness-type double patenting rejection is appropriate where the conflicting claims are not identical, but at least one examined application claim is not patentably distinct from the reference claim(s) because the examined application claim is either anticipated by, or would have been obvious over, the reference claim(s). See, e.g., In re Berg, 140 F.3d 1428, 46 USPQ2d 1226 (Fed. Cir. 1998); In re Goodman, 11 F.3d 1046, 29 USPQ2d 2010 (Fed. Cir. 1993); In re Longi, 759 F.2d 887, 225 USPQ 645 (Fed. Cir. 1985); In re Van Ornum, 686 F.2d 937, 214 USPQ 761 (CCPA 1982); In re Vogel, 422 F.2d 438, 164 USPQ 619 (CCPA 1970); and In re Thorington, 418 F.2d 528, 163 USPQ 644 (CCPA 1969).

A timely filed terminal disclaimer in compliance with 37 CFR 1.321(c) or 1.321(d) may be used to overcome an actual or provisional rejection based on a nonstatutory double patenting ground provided the conflicting application or patent either is shown to be commonly owned with this application, or claims an invention made as a result of activities undertaken within the scope of a joint research agreement.

Effective January 1, 1994, a registered attorney or agent of record may sign a terminal disclaimer. A terminal disclaimer signed by the assignee must fully comply with 37 CFR 3.73(b).

Claims 6 to 15 are rejected on the ground of nonstatutory obviousness-type double patenting as being unpatentable over claims 1 to 5, 7, and 10 to 12 of U.S. Patent No. 6,610,419 B1 (Stamm). Although the conflicting claims are not identical, they are not patentably distinct from each other because both sets of claims are directed to a protective layer for a component

Application/Control Number: 10/811,891

Art Unit: 1775

substrate wherein the protective layer consists essentially of an alloy based on nickel-cobalt-iron-chromium-aluminum-yttrium with additions of rhenium, and both sets of claims contain overlapping alloy elemental ranges. It would have been obvious to one having ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made to have selected the overlapping portions of the alloy elemental ranges taught by Stamm and arrive at the protective layer alloy compositions as claimed by the applicant. The Examiner notes that the Stamm patent claims require the presence of an outer MCrAlY alloy layer that is predominantly in the  $\gamma$ -phase. Also, the MCrAlY alloy layers claimed by the applicant are expected to be very thin (on the order of microns).

# Allowable Subject Matter

Claims 16 to 19 are allowed.

### Conclusion

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the Examiner should be directed to Robert Koehler whose telephone number is **(571) 272-1536**. The Examiner can normally be reached on Tuesday to Friday from 9:30 AM to 7:00 PM. The Examiner can also be reached on alternate Mondays.

If attempts to reach the Examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the Examiner's supervisor, Deborah Jones, can be reached on (571) 272-1535. The official Fax No. is (571) 273-8300, and the After-Final Fax No. is (571) 273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <a href="http://pair-direct.uspto.gov">http://pair-direct.uspto.gov</a>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

ROBERT R. KOEHLER PRIMARY EXAMINER

Art Unit 1775 December 12, 2005